

# **Basics of Cost of Service Regulation**

#### **Peter Cappers**

EV Grid Assist – Rates & Incentives October 25, 2022

This work was funded by the U.S. Department of Energy's Office of Electricity, under Contract No. DE-AC02-05CH11231.



# Allowing more than one company in a network industry to compete results in redundancy and higher costs



Source: https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:New\_York\_utility\_lines\_in\_1890.jpg



### **Overview of Cost of Service (COS) Regulation**

Electric utilities are generally monopolists

- Absent a competitive market, regulators must play role of enforcing economic efficiency
- Regulators strive to approve rates that are reflective of the costs of the services rendered by utilities
  - Costs must be deemed to be prudently incurred for inclusion in rates
  - Assets paid for in rates should be used and useful
  - Rates must be deemed fair and reasonable
  - Rates must allow a utility the opportunity to both sufficiently recover its incurred costs and to earn returns comparable to what a similarly situated utility would achieve



### Elements of a Cost of Service (COS) Study

1. Determine the annual cost of serving all of the utility's customers



#### Elements of a Cost of Service (COS) Study

2. Determine the cost responsibility for each customer class



### Elements of a Cost of Service (COS) Study

3. Design rates that collect class-level revenue requirement for all customers in the class



# **Components of Revenue Requirement (RR)**



# **Test Year Revenue Requirement (RR)**



**Revenue Requirement Example** 

The annual revenue requirement amount can be compared to the size of a pie that is needed to serve all of the utility's retail customers over a year
The "Test Year" RR is the amount used to design rates in the general rate case. This may be a recent historical value or a future projected value.

## **Allocation of RR to Customer Classes**



The revenue requirement allocation determines revenue requirement amount that each customer class is responsible for

 This is analogous to dividing the pie into slices that correspond to the revenue responsibility for <u>each customer class</u>



#### **Allocation Factors Allocate RR to Customer Classes**

In the cost of service study, "allocation factors" are used to allocate each cost in the revenue requirement to individual customer classes

□ Allocation factors should match how costs are incurred (cost drivers)

Embedded Cost Category	Example Allocation Factors
Fuel, Variable O&M	<u>Energy usage</u> in each class (i.e., annual kWh consumption, by class)
Fixed O&M Depreciation Return	Coincident Peak Demand in each class (i.e., 1 CP, 2 CP, 4 CP, 12 CP)
Income Tax	<u>Number of Customers</u> in each class (i.e., meters, accounts)
Cost categories: Distribution, Transmission, Generation, Customer	



# Cost Allocation Example: Fuel & Purchased Power Costs

Allocation Component	Total	Residential	Commercial
Fuel & Purchased Power (\$M)	\$100		
Allocator: Energy Usage (MWh)	600,000	230,000	370,000
Allocation Factor (%)	100%	38%	62%
Allocated RR (\$MM)	\$100	\$38	\$62





This example shows the allocation of fuel & purchased power costs among residential and commercial customer classes using an energy usage (MWh) allocator



## **Rate Design**



Rate design determines how each slice of the revenue requirement pie is collected
The rate design step allocates revenue responsibility to each customer in each class.
Ideally, the entire slice of pie is collected from customers annually.



#### Retail rates are designed based on two broad concepts





# Rate Design Criteria (Bonbright Principles)

Principles of Public Utility Rates **Public Utilities Reports, Inc.** 

# Commonly employed rate design principles include the following:

- Customer understanding
- Ease of implementation
- Collects utility's cost of service
- Fairly apportions costs among customers
- Avoids undue discrimination

#### Balancing these principles can be more of an art rather than a science

Typically involves prioritizing policy goals such as sending economically efficient price signals, achieving GHG targets, enabling or promoting technology adoption of distributed resources



# Rate Design: Common Rate Components

### Volumetric Energy Charge

- Options: Flat, differs by quantity (inclining/declining blocks) and/or time-of-use (peak vs. off-peak period).
- Science: Ideally based on energy costs driven by electricity usage. Can include generation capacity costs.
- Art: In actuality, balances policy goals and ability of customers to understand and respond to price signals.



\$/kWh

# Rate Design: Common Rate Components

#### \$/kWh

\$/kW-mo

### Volumetric Energy Charge

- **Options**: Flat, differs by quantity (inclining/declining blocks) and/or time-of-use (peak vs. off-peak period).
- Science: Ideally based on energy costs driven by electricity usage. Can include generation capacity costs.
- Art: In actuality, balances policy goals and ability of customers to understand and respond to price signals.

### Volumetric Demand Charge

- **Options**: Differs by customer peak demand measurement period (i.e., coincident or non-coincident). May also vary by time of use.
- Science: Ideally based on fixed costs driven by distribution and/or generation capacity infrastructure.
- Art: In actuality, balances metering ability and customer understanding of demand-based price signals.



# Rate Design: Common Rate Components

#### \$/kWh

### Volumetric Energy Charge

- **Options**: Flat, differs by quantity (inclining/declining blocks) and/or time-of-use (peak vs. off-peak period).
- Science: Ideally based on energy costs driven by electricity usage. Can include generation capacity costs.
- Art: In actuality, balances policy goals and ability of customers to understand and respond to price signals.

#### \$/kW-mo

#### Volumetric Demand Charge

- **Options**: Differs by customer peak demand measurement period (i.e., coincident or non-coincident). May also vary by time of use.
- Science: Ideally based on fixed costs driven by distribution and/or generation capacity infrastructure.
- Art: In actuality, balances metering ability and customer understanding of demand-based price signals.

#### \$/Month

### Customer Charge

- Options: Differs by customer class, size of customer (kWh, kW).
- Science: Ideally based on customer-related fixed costs (metering, billing, accounts).
- Art: In actuality, balances energy price signal and low-usage customer impacts.

# **Rate Design Example**

RR Component	Total	Residential	Commercial
Non-fuel O&M			
(A) Allocated RR (\$MM)	\$85	\$41	\$44
(B) Billing Determinants (MWh)	600,000	230,000	370,000
Rate = A / B (¢/kWh)	\$14.2	\$17.8	\$11.9

#### **Revenue Requirement Example**

\$300

\$0

#### □ In summary:

- Rates are designed to collect the revenue requirement that is allocated to each customer class
- For each class and rate component, rates equal the allocated RR ÷ billing determinants



### **Ideal Outcome of CoS Ratemaking**





#### **Most Likely Outcome of CoS Ratemaking**





Retail Rates (¢/kWh)

Utility Costs / Rev. (\$M)



 When revenue growth exceeds cost growth between general rate cases (GRC), ceteris paribus, utility financial picture improves

Utility increases its annual profits by not carrying out a GRC, leaving rates as is

Regulators would need to compel utility to file a GRC, which in this scenario would reduce rates, but this only solves the problem temporarily

Even if the utility files periodic GRCs, this issue persists between rate cases

### **Cost Growth > Revenue Growth**



 When cost growth exceeds revenue growth between GRCs, *ceteris paribus*, the utility financial picture gets worse

 The utility can have more frequent GRCs, but that only solves the problem temporarily

 If the utility does not file a GRC, the problem just keeps getting worse

More systemic issues may need to be addressed



# The Regulatory Balancing Act: Balancing Utility, Policy and Ratepayer Objectives

#### **Utility Financial Health**

- Allowed revenue requirement & allowed rate of return
- Allowed rate levels
- > Approval of capital expenditures
- Interval between general rate cases
- Surcharges, decoupling



#### Impacts on Ratepayers

- Retail rate levels
- Bill impacts
- Complexity of rate structures
- Distributed resource programs, including program incentives
- Cost Shifts from DER programs

- ➢ GRC frequency, rate designs, Low-income customer protections
- > Distributed resource program size, incentives
- Utility vs third-party ownership of generation
- Utility shareholder incentives
- Providing predictable regulation to support beneficial utility financial health outcomes



#### **Questions/Comments**

# Peter Cappers +1 (315) 637-0513 pacappers@lbl.gov



